WEST VIRGINIA LEGISLATURE

REGULAR SESSION, 1990

ENROLLED

Com. Sub. for HOUSE BILL No. 4596

(By Mr. Speaker, Mr. Chambers, & Del. R. Burk)
[By Requet]

Passed March 10, 1990
In Effect 90 Days from Passage

ENROLLED

COMMITTEE SUBSTITUTE

FOR

H. B. 4596

(By Mr. Speaker, Mr. Chambers, and Delegate R. Burk)
[By Request]

[Passed March 10, 1990; in effect ninety days from passage.]

AN ACT to amend and reenact section four, article one. chapter six-b of the code of West Virginia, one thousand nine hundred thirty-one, as amended; to amend and reenact sections three, four, five, seven and eight, article two of said chapter; to amend said chapter two by adding thereto a new article, designated article two-a; and to amend and reenact section four, article three of said chapter, all relating generally to ethical standards of governmental officials and employees and disclosure of financial interest of such persons; providing additional immunity from sanctions for persons acting in good faith reliance on ethics commission advisory opinions: the selection of investigative panel members: providing public disclosure of certain commission actions; providing that members of an investigative panel which finds probable cause cannot serve on the commission panel which renders final decision in case; the finding of truth or falsity of charges by the commission; requiring public disclosure of conciliation agreements; abeyance of commission action pending referral for criminal investigation; use of public office

ì

for private gain; permitting solicitation for charitable purposes; interests of public officials, public employees in public contracts; exemption from prohibited activities for persons employed in higher education; requiring disclosure of identity and nature of additional sources of income; excluding spouse's income from reporting requirements; disclosure of debtors and creditors; exempting certain debts and loans from being reported; requiring additional disclosure of gifts; emergency rule revoked; all disclosures made in manner prescribed by legislative rules; changes in expenditures to be reported by lobbyists; and deletion of provisions for requiring lobbyists to report additional information by legislative rule.

Be it enacted by the Legislature of West Virginia:

That section four, article one, chapter six-b of the code of West Virginia, one thousand nine hundred thirty-one, as amended, be amended and reenacted; that sections three, four, five, seven and eight, article two of said chapter be amended and reenacted; that said chapter be amended by adding thereto a new article, designated article two-a; and that section four, article three of said chapter be amended and reenacted, all to read as follows:

ARTICLE 1. SHORT TITLE; LEGISLATIVE FINDINGS, PUR-POSES AND INTENT; CONSTRUCTION AND AP-PLICATION OF CHAPTER; SEVERABILITY.

§6B-1-4. Remedies and penalties in addition to other applicable remedies and penalties.

- 1 The provisions of this chapter shall be in addition to
- 2 any other applicable provisions of this code and except 3 for the immunity provided by section three, article two,
- 4 of this chapter shall not be deemed to be in derogation
- of this chapter shall not be deemed to be in derogation of or as a substitution for any other provisions of this
- 6 code, including, but not limited to, article five-a, chapter
- 7 sixty-one of this code and except for the immunity
- 8 provided by section three, article two, of this chapter the
- 9 remedies and penalties provided in this chapter shall be
- 10 in addition to any other remedies or penalties which
- 11 may be applicable to any circumstances relevant to both.

ARTICLE 2. WEST VIRGINIA ETHICS COMMISSION; POWERS AND DUTIES; DISCLOSURE OF FINANCIAL INTEREST BY PUBLIC OFFICIALS AND EMPLOYEES; APPEARANCES BEFORE PUBLIC AGENCIES.

§6B-2-3. Advisory opinions.

A person subject to the provisions of this chapter may 2 make application in writing to the ethics commission for 3 an advisory opinion on whether an action or proposed 4 action violates the provisions of this chapter or the 5 provisions of section fifteen, article ten, chapter sixty-6 one of this code and would thereby expose the person 7 to sanctions by the commission or criminal prosecution. 8 The commission shall respond within thirty days from 9 the receipt of the request by issuing an advisory opinion on the matter raised in the request. All advisory 10 11 opinions shall be published and indexed in the code of 12 state rules by the secretary of state: Provided, That 13 before an advisory opinion is made public, any material 14 which may identify the person who is the subject of the 15 opinion shall, to the fullest extent possible, be deleted 16 and the identity of the person shall not be revealed. A 17 person subject to the provisions of this chapter may rely upon the published guidelines or an advisory opinion of 18 19 the commission, and any person acting in good faith 20 reliance on any such guideline or opinion shall be 21 immune from the sanctions of this chapter and the 22 sanctions of section fifteen, article ten, chapter sixty-one 23 of this code, and shall have an absolute defense to any 24 criminal prosecution for actions taken in good faith 25 reliance upon any such opinion or guideline in regard to the sanctions of this chapter and the sanctions of 26 27 section fifteen, article ten, chapter sixty-one of this code.

§6B-2-4. Complaints; dismissals; hearings; disposition; judicial review.

1 (a) Upon the filing by any person with the commission
2 of a complaint which is duly verified by oath or
3 affirmation, the executive director of the commission or
4 his or her designee shall, within three working days,
5 acknowledge the receipt of the complaint by first class
6 mail, unless the complainant or his or her representative
7 personally filed the complaint with the commission and

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

30

31

32

33

34

35

36

37

38

39

40

41

42

43

44

45

46

47

- 8 was given a receipt or other acknowledgement evidenc-9 ing the filing. Within fourteen days after the receipt of 10 a complaint, an investigative panel shall be appointed to investigate the substance of the allegations in the 11 12 complaint and to determine whether there is probable 13 cause to believe that a violation of this chapter has 14 occurred. The commission shall establish by legislative 15 rule promulgated in accordance with chapter twenty-16 nine-a of this code a rotation system for the selection of 17 commission members to sit on investigative panels 18 whereby the caseload of commission investigations is 19 distributed among commission members as evenly and 20 randomly as possible.
 - (b) In the case of a filed complaint, the first inquiry of the investigative panel shall be a question as to whether or not the allegations of the complaint, if taken as true, would constitute a violation of law upon which the commission could properly act under the provisions of this chapter. If the complaint is determined by a majority vote of the investigative panel to be insufficient in this regard, the investigative panel shall dismiss the complaint.
 - (c) After the commission receives a complaint found by the investigative panel to be sufficient, the executive director shall give notice of a pending investigation by the investigative panel to the complainant and respondent. The notice of investigation shall be mailed to the parties, and, in the case of the respondent, shall be mailed as certified mail, return receipt requested, marked "Addressee only, personal and confidential". The notice shall describe the conduct of the respondent which is the basis for an alleged violation of law, and if a complaint has been filed, a copy of the complaint shall be appended to the notice mailed to the respondent. Each notice of investigation shall inform the respondent that the purpose of the investigation is to determine whether probable cause exists to believe that a violation of law has occurred which may subject the respondent to administrative sanctions by the commission, criminal prosecution by the state, or civil liability. The notice shall further inform the respondent that he or she has

49 a right to appear before the investigative panel, and that 50 he or she may respond in writing to the commission within thirty days after the receipt of the notice, but 52 that no fact or allegation shall be taken as admitted by 53 a failure or refusal to timely respond.

51

54

55

56

57

58

59

60

61

62

63

64

65

66

67

68

69

70

71

72

73

74

75

76

77

78

79

80

81

82

83

84

85

86

87

88

89

(d) Within the forty-five day period following the mailing of a notice of investigation, the investigative panel shall proceed to consider (1) the allegations raised in the complaint, (2) any timely received written response of the respondent, and (3) any other competent evidence gathered by or submitted to the commission which has a proper bearing on the issue of probable cause. A respondent shall be afforded the opportunity to appear before the investigative panel and make an oral response to the complaint. The commission shall, in promulgating legislative rules pursuant to the provisions of subsection (a), section two of this article, prescribe the manner in which a respondent may present his or her oral response to the investigative panel. The commission may request a respondent to disclose specific amounts received from a source, and other detailed information not otherwise required to be set forth in a statement or report filed under the provisions of this chapter, if the information sought is deemed to be probative as to the issues raised by a complaint or an investigation initiated by the commission. Any information thus received shall be confidential except as provided by subsection (f) of this section. If the person so requested fails or refuses to furnish the information to the commission, the commission may exercise its subpoena power as provided for elsewhere in this chapter, and any subpoena issued thereunder shall have the same force and effect as a subpoena issued by a circuit court of this state, and enforcement of any such subpoena may be had upon application to a circuit court of the county in which the investigative panel is conducting an investigation, through the issuance of a rule or an attachment against the respondent as in cases of contempt.

(e)(1) All investigations, complaints, reports, records, proceedings, and other information received by the

 $103\\104$

 $105 \\ 106$

- commission and related to complaints made to the commission or investigations conducted by the commission pursuant to this section, including the identity of the complainant or respondent, shall be confidential and shall not be knowingly and improperly disclosed by any member or former member of the commission or its staff, except as follows:
 - (A) Upon a finding that probable cause exists to believe that a respondent has violated the provisions of this chapter, the complaint and all reports, records, non-privileged and non-deliberative material introduced at any probable cause hearing held pursuant to the complaint are thereafter not confidential: *Provided*, That confidentiality of such information shall remain in full force and effect until the respondent has been served by the commission with a copy of the investigative panel's order finding probable cause and with the statement of charges prepared pursuant to the provisions of subsection (g) of this section.
 - (B) After a finding of probable cause as aforesaid, any subsequent hearing held in the matter for the purpose of receiving evidence or the arguments of the parties or their representatives shall be open to the public and all reports, records and non-deliberative materials introduced into evidence at such subsequent hearing, as well as the commission's orders, are not confidential.
- 116 (C) The commission may release any information 117 relating to an investigation at any time if the release has 118 been agreed to in writing by the respondent.
 - (D) The complaint as well as the identity of the complainant shall be disclosed to a person named as respondent in any such complaint filed with the commission immediately upon such respondent's request.
 - (E) Where the commission is otherwise required by the provisions of this chapter to disclose such information or to proceed in such a manner that disclosure is necessary and required to fulfill such requirements.
 - (2) If, in a specific case, the commission finds that

129 there is a reasonable likelihood that the dissemination 130 of information or opinion in connection with a pending 131 or imminent proceeding will interfere with a fair 132 hearing or otherwise prejudice the due administration 133 of justice, the commission shall order that all or a 134 portion of the information communicated to the commis-135 sion to cause an investigation and all allegations of 136 ethical misconduct or criminal acts contained in a 137 complaint shall be confidential, and the person provid-138 ing such information or filing a complaint shall be 139 bound to confidentiality until further order of the 140 commission.

141

142

143

144

145

146

147

148

149

150

151

152

153

154

155

156

157

158

159

160

161

162

163

164

165

166

167

168

169

(f) If a majority of the members of the investigative panel fails to find probable cause, the proceedings shall be dismissed by the commission in an order signed by the majority members of the panel, and copies of the order of dismissal shall be sent to the complainant and served upon the respondent forthwith. If the investigative panel decides by a majority vote that there is probable cause to believe that a violation under this chapter has occurred, the majority members of the investigative panel shall sign an order directing the commission staff to prepare a statement of charges, to assign the matter for hearing to the commission or a hearing examiner as the commission may subsequently direct, and to schedule a hearing to determine the truth or falsity of the charges, such hearing to be held within ninety days after the date of the order. For the purpose of this section, service of process upon the respondent is obtained at the time the respondent or the respondent's agent physically receives the process, regardless of whether the service of process is in person or by certified mail.

(g) At least eighty days prior to the date of the hearing, the respondent shall be served by certified mail, return receipt requested, with the statement of charges and a notice of hearing setting forth the date, time and place for the hearing. The scheduled hearing may be continued only upon a showing of good cause by the respondent or under such other circumstances as the commission shall, by legislative rule, direct.

- 170 (h) The commission members who have not served as members of an investigative panel in a particular case
- 172 may sit as a hearing board to adjudicate the case or may
- 173 permit an assigned hearing examiner employed by the
- 174 commission to preside at the taking of evidence. The
- 175 commission shall, by legislative rule, establish the
- 176 general qualifications for hearing examiners. Such
- 177 legislative rule shall also contain provisions which seek
- to ensure that the functions of a hearing examiner will
- 179 be conducted in an impartial manner, and shall describe
- 180 the circumstances and procedures for disqualification of
- 181 hearing examiners.
- 182 (i) A member of the commission or a hearing examiner presiding at a hearing may:
- 184 (1) Administer oaths and affirmations, compel the
- 185 attendance of witnesses and the production of docu-
- 186 ments, examine witnesses and parties, and otherwise
- 187 take testimony and establish a record;
- 188 (2) Rule on offers of proof and receive relevant 189 evidence:
- 190 (3) Take depositions or have depositions taken when
- 191 the ends of justice may be served;
- 192 (4) Regulate the course of the hearing;
- 193 (5) Hold conferences for the settlement or simplifica-
- 194 tion of issues by consent of the parties;
- 195 (6) Dispose of procedural requests or similar matters;
- 196 (7) Accept stipulated agreements;
- 197 (8) Take other action authorized by the ethics commis-
- 198 sion consistent with the provisions of this chapter.
- (j) With respect to allegations of a violation under this
- 200 chapter, the complainant has the burden of proof. The
- 201 West Virginia rules of evidence as used to govern
- 202 proceedings in the courts of this state shall be given like
- 203 effect in hearings held before the commission or a
- 204 hearing examiner. The commission shall, by legislative
- 205 rule, regulate the conduct of hearings so as to provide
- 206 full procedural due process to a respondent. Hearings

before a hearing examiner shall be recorded electronically. When requested by either of the parties, the presiding officer shall make a transcript, verified by oath or affirmation, of each hearing held and so recorded. In the discretion of the commission, a record of the proceedings may be made by a certified court reporter. Unless otherwise ordered by the commission. the cost of preparing a transcript shall be paid by the party requesting the transcript. Upon a showing of indigency, the commission may provide a transcript without charge. Within fifteen days following the hearing, either party may submit to the hearing examiner that party's proposed findings of fact. The hearing examiner shall thereafter prepare his or her own proposed findings of fact and make copies of the findings available to the parties. The hearing examiner shall then submit the entire record to the commission for final decision.

- (k) The recording of the hearing or the transcript of testimony, as the case may be, and the exhibits, together with all papers and requests filed in the proceeding, and the proposed findings of fact of the hearing examiner and the parties, constitute the exclusive record for decision by the commission members who have not served as members of the investigative panel, unless by leave of the commission a party is permitted to submit additional documentary evidence or take and file depositions or otherwise exercise discovery.
- (l) The commission shall set a time and place for the hearing of arguments by the complainant and respondent, or their respective representatives, and shall notify the parties thereof, and briefs may be filed by the parties in accordance with procedural rules promulgated by the commission. The final decision of the commission shall be made by the commission members who have not served as members of the investigative panel in writing within forty-five days of the receipt of the entire record of a hearing held before a hearing examiner or, in the case of an evidentiary hearing held by the board in lieu of a hearing examiner, within twenty-one days following the close of the evidence.

- 248 (m) A decision on the truth or falsity of the charges 249 against the respondent and a decision to impose 250 sanctions must be approved by at least six members of 251 the commission who have not served as members of the 252 investigative panel.
- 253 (n) Members of the commission shall recuse them-254 selves from a particular case upon their own motion 255 with the approval of the commission or for good cause 256 shown upon motion of a party. The remaining members 257 of the commission shall, by majority vote, select a 258 temporary member of the commission to replace a 259 recused member: Provided, That the temporary member 260 selected to replace a recused member shall be a person 261 of the same status or category, provided by subsection 262 (b), section one of this article, as the recused member.
 - (o) A complainant may be assisted by a member of the commission staff assigned by the commission after a determination of probable cause.
 - (p) No member of the commission staff may participate in the commission deliberations or communicate with commission members concerning the merits of a complaint after being assigned to prosecute a complaint.
- 270 (q) If the commission finds by evidence beyond a 271 reasonable doubt that the facts alleged in the complaint 272 are true and constitute a material violation of this 273 article, it may impose one or more of the following 274 sanctions:
- 275 (1) Public reprimand;

264

265

 $\begin{array}{c} 266 \\ 267 \end{array}$

268

- 276 (2) Cease and desist orders;
- 277 (3) Orders of restitution for money, things of value, or 278 services taken or received in violation of this chapter; 279 or
- 280 (4) Fines not to exceed one thousand dollars per 281 violation.
- In addition to imposing such sanctions, the commission may recommend to the appropriate governmental body that a respondent be terminated from employment or removed from office.

The commission may institute civil proceedings in the circuit court of the county wherein a violation occurred for the enforcement of sanctions.

- (r) At any stage of the proceedings under this section, the commission may enter into a conciliation agreement with a respondent if such agreement is deemed by a majority of the members of the commission to be in the best interest of the state and the respondent. Any conciliation agreement must be disclosed to the public: *Provided*, That negotiations leading to a conciliation agreement, as well as information obtained by the commission during such negotiations, shall remain confidential except as may be otherwise set forth in the agreement.
- (s) Decisions of the commission involving the issuance of sanctions may be appealed to the circuit court of Kanawha County, West Virginia, or to the circuit court of the county where the violation is alleged to have occurred, only by the respondent, and only upon the grounds set forth in section four, article five, chapter twenty-nine-a of this code.
- (t) In the event the commission finds in favor of the person complained against, the commission shall order reimbursement of all actual costs incurred, including, but not limited to, attorney fees to be paid to the person complained against by the complainant, if the commission finds that the complaint was brought or made in bad faith. In addition, the aggrieved party shall have a cause of action and be entitled to compensatory damages, punitive damages, costs and attorney fees for a complaint made or brought in bad faith.
- (u) If at any stage in the proceedings under this section, it appears to an investigative panel, a hearing examiner or the commission that a criminal violation may have been committed by a respondent, such situation shall be brought before the full commission for its consideration. If, by a vote of two-thirds of the full commission, it is determined that probable cause exists to believe a criminal violation has occurred, it may recommend to the appropriate county prosecuting

9

10

11 12

13

14

15

16

- 326 attorney having jurisdiction over the case that a 327 criminal investigation be commenced. Deliberations of 328 the commission with regard to a recommendation for 329 criminal investigation by a prosecuting attorney shall be 330 private and confidential. Notwithstanding any other 331 provision of this article, once a referral for criminal 332 investigation is made under the provisions of this 333 subsection, the ethics proceedings shall be held in 334 abevance until action on the referred matter is con-335 cluded. If the commission determines that a criminal 336 violation has not occurred, the commission shall remand 337 the matter to the investigative panel, the hearing 338 examiner or the commission itself as a hearing board. 339 as the case may be, for further proceedings under this 340 article.
- (v) The provisions of this section shall apply to violations of this chapter occurring after the thirtieth day of September, one thousand nine hundred eightynine, and within one year before the filing of a complaint under subsection (a) of this section or the appointment of an investigative panel by the commission under subsection (b) of this section.

§6B-2-5. Ethical standards for elected and appointed officials and public employees.

- 1 (a) Persons subject to section.—The provisions of this section apply to all elected and appointed public officials and public employees, whether full or part time, in state, county, municipal governments and their respective boards, agencies, departments, and commissions and in any other regional or local governmental agency, including county school boards.
 - (b) Use of public office for private gain.—(1) A public official or public employee may not knowingly and intentionally use his or her office or the prestige of his or her office for his or her own private gain or that of another person. The performance of usual and customary duties associated with the office or position or the advancement of public policy goals or constituent services, without compensation, does not constitute the use of prestige of office for private gain.

17 (2) The Legislature, in enacting this subsection (b), 18 relating to the use of public office or public employment 19 for private gain, recognizes that there may be certain 20 public officials or public employees who bring to their 21 respective offices or employment their own unique 22 personal prestige which is based upon their intelligence. 23 education, experience, skills and abilities, or other 24 personal gifts or traits. In many cases, these persons 25 bring a personal prestige to their office or employment 26 which inures to the benefit of the state and its citizens. 27 Such persons may, in fact, be sought by the state to 28 serve in their office or employment because, through 29 their unusual gifts or traits, they bring stature and 30 recognition to their office or employment and to the 31 state itself. While the office or employment held or to 32 be held by such persons may have its own inherent 33 prestige, it would be unfair to such individuals and 34 against the best interests of the citizens of this state to 35 deny such persons the right to hold public office or be 36 publicly employed on the grounds that they would, in 37 addition to the emoluments of their office or employ-38 ment, be in a position to benefit financially from the 39 personal prestige which otherwise inheres to them. 40 Accordingly, the commission is directed, by legislative 41 rule, to establish categories of such public officials and 42 public employees, identifying them generally by the 43 office or employment held, and offering persons who fit 44 within such categories the opportunity to apply for an 45 exemption from the application of the provisions of this 46 subsection. Such exemptions may be granted by the 47 commission, on a case-by-case basis, when it is shown 48 that: (A) The public office held or the public employ-49 ment engaged in is not such that it would ordinarily be 50 available or offered to a substantial number of the 51 citizens of this state; (B) the office held or the employ-52 ment engaged in is such that it normally or specifically 53 requires a person who possesses personal prestige; and (C) the person's employment contract or letter of 54 55 appointment provides or anticipates that the person will 56 gain financially from activities which are not a part of 57 his or her office or employment.

- not solicit any gift unless the solicitation is for a charitable purpose with no resulting direct pecuniary benefit conferred upon the official or employee or his or her immediate family: Provided, That no public official or public employee may solicit for a charitable purpose any gift from any person who is also an official or employee of the state and whose position as such is subordinate to the soliciting official or employee: Provided, however, That nothing herein shall prohibit a candidate for public office from soliciting a lawful political contribution. No official or employee may knowingly accept any gift, directly or indirectly, from a lobbyist or from any person whom the official or employee knows or has reason to know:
- 73 (A) Is doing or seeking to do business of any kind with 74 his or her agency;
 - (B) Is engaged in activities which are regulated or controlled by his or her agency; or
 - (C) Has financial interests which may be substantially and materially affected, in a manner distinguishable from the public generally, by the performance or nonperformance of his official duties.
 - (2) Notwithstanding the provisions of subdivision (1) of this subsection, a person who is a public official or public employee may accept a gift described in this subdivision, and there shall be a presumption that the receipt of such gift does not impair the impartiality and independent judgment of the person. This presumption may be rebutted only by direct objective evidence that the gift did impair the impartiality and independent judgment of the person or that the person knew or had reason to know that the gift was offered with the intent to impair his or her impartiality and independent judgment. The provisions of subdivision (1) of this subsection do not apply to:
 - (A) Meals and beverages;
- 95 (B) Ceremonial gifts or awards which have insignif-96 icant monetary value;
 - (C) Unsolicited gifts of nominal value or trivial items

98 of informational value;

117

118

119

120

121

122

123

124

125

126

127

128

129

130

131

132

133

134

- (D) Reasonable expenses for food, travel, and lodging of the official or employee for a meeting at which the official or employee participates in a panel or speaking engagement at the meeting;
- 103 (E) Gifts of tickets or free admission extended to a 104 public official or public employee to attend charitable, 105 cultural or political events, if the purpose of such gift 106 or admission is a courtesy or ceremony customarily 107 extended to the office;
- 108 (F) Gifts that are purely private and personal in 109 nature; or
- 110 (G) Gifts from relatives by blood or marriage, or a 111 member of the same household.
- 112 (3) The acceptance of an honorarium by an elected 113 public official is prohibited. The commission shall, by 114 legislative rule, establish guidelines for the acceptance 115 of reasonable honorariums by all other public officials 116 and public employees other than elected public officials.
 - (4) Nothing in this section shall be construed so as to prohibit the giving of a lawful political contribution as defined by law.
 - (5) The governor or his designee, may, in the name of the state of West Virginia, accept and receive gifts from any public or private source. Any such gift so obtained shall become the property of the state and shall, within thirty days of the receipt thereof, be registered with the commission and the department of culture and history.
 - (d) *Interests in public contracts.*—(1) In addition to the provisions of section fifteen, article ten, chapter sixtyone of this code, no elected or appointed public official or public employee or member of his or her immediate family or business with which he or she is associated may be a party to or have an interest in the profits or benefits of a contract which such official or employee may have direct authority to enter into, or over which he or she may have control: *Provided*, That nothing herein shall be construed to prevent or make unlawful

- 136 the employment of any person with any governmental 137 body: Provided, however, That nothing herein shall be 138 construed to prohibit a member of the Legislature from 139 entering into a contract with any governmental body, or 140 prohibit a part-time appointed public official from 141 entering into a contract which such part-time appointed 142 public official may have direct authority to enter into 143 or over which he or she may have control when such 144 official has been recused from deciding or evaluating 145 and excused from voting on such contract and has fully 146 disclosed the extent of such interest in the contract.
- 147 (2) In the absence of bribery or a purpose to defraud. 148 an elected or appointed public official or public 149 employee or a member of his or her immediate family 150 or a business with which he or she is associated shall 151 not be considered as having an interest in a public 152 contract when such a person has a limited interest as 153 an owner, shareholder or creditor of the business which 154 is the contractor on the public contract involved. A 155 limited interest for the purposes of this subsection is:
 - (A) An interest:

164

165

166

167

168

169

170

171

172

- 157 (i) Not exceeding ten percent of the partnership or the outstanding shares of a corporation; or
- 159 (ii) Not exceeding thirty thousand dollars interest in 160 the profits or benefits of the contract; or
- 161 (B) An interest as a creditor:
- 162 (i) Not exceeding ten percent of the total indebtedness 163 of a business; or
 - (ii) Not exceeding thirty thousand dollars interest in the profits or benefits of the contract.
 - (3) Where the provisions of subdivisions (1) and (2) of this subsection would result in the loss of a quorum in a public body or agency, in excessive cost, undue hardship, or other substantial interference with the operation of a state, county, municipality, county school board or other governmental agency, the affected governmental body or agency may make written application to the ethics commission for an exemption

174 from subdivisions (1) and (2) of this subsection.

- (e) Confidential information.—No present or former public official or employee may knowingly and improperly disclose any confidential information acquired by him or her in the course of his or her official duties nor use such information to further his or her personal interests or the interests of another person.
 - (f) Prohibited representation.—No present or former elected or appointed public official or public employee shall during or after his or her public employment or service represent a client or act in a representative capacity with or without compensation on behalf of any person in a contested case, rate-making proceeding, license or permit application, regulation filing or other specific matter which arose during his or her period of public service or employment and in which he or she personally participated in a decision-making, advisory or staff support capacity.
 - (g) Limitation on practice before a board, agency, commission or department.—(1) No elected or appointed public official and no full-time staff attorney or accountant shall, during his or her public service or public employment or for a period of six months after the termination of his or her public service or public employment with a governmental entity authorized to hear contested cases or promulgate regulations, appear in a representative capacity before the governmental entity in which he or she serves or served or is or was employed in the following matters:
- 203 (A) A contested case involving an administrative 204 sanction, action or refusal to act;
- 205 (B) To support or oppose a proposed regulation;
- 206 (C) To support or contest the issuance or denial of a 207 license or permit;
- 208 (D) A rate-making proceeding; and
- 209 (E) To influence the expenditure of public funds.
- 210 (2) As used in this subsection, "represent" includes any 211 formal or informal appearance before, or any written or

- oral communication with, any public agency on behalf of any person: *Provided*, That nothing contained in this subsection shall prohibit, during any period, a former public official or employee from being retained by or employed to represent, assist, or act in a representative capacity on behalf of the public agency by which he or she was employed or in which he or she served. Nothing in this subsection shall be construed to prevent a former public official or employee from representing another state, county, municipal or other governmental entity before the governmental entity in which he or she served or was employed within six months after the termina-tion of his or her employment or service in the entity.
 - (3) A present or former public official or employee may appear at anytime in a representative capacity before the Legislature, a county commission, city or town council or county school board in relation to the consideration of a statute, budget, ordinance, rule, resolution or enactment.
 - (4) Members and former members of the Legislature and professional employees and former professional employees of the Legislature shall be permitted to appear in a representative capacity on behalf of clients before any governmental agency of the state, or of county or municipal governments including county school boards.
 - (5) An elected or appointed public official, full-time staff attorney or accountant who would be adversely affected by the provisions of this subsection (g) may apply to the ethics commission for an exemption from the six months prohibition against appearing in a representative capacity, when the person's education and experience is such that the prohibition would, for all practical purposes, deprive the person of the ability to earn a livelihood in this state outside of the governmental agency. The ethics commission shall by legislative rule establish general guidelines or standards for granting an exemption or reducing the time period, but shall decide each application on a case-by-case basis.
 - (h) Seeking employment with regulated person prohi-

- bited.—(1) No full-time public official or full-time public employee who exercises policymaking, nonministerial or regulatory authority may seek employment with, or allow himself or herself to be employed by any person who is or may be regulated by the governmental body which he or she serves while he or she is employed or serves in the governmental agency. The term "employ-ment" within the meaning of this section includes professional services and other services rendered by the public official or public employee whether rendered as an employee or as an independent contractor.
 - (2) No person regulated by a governmental agency shall offer employment to a full-time public official or full-time public employee of the regulating governmental agency during the period of time the public official or employee works or serves in such agency.

- (3) A full-time public official or full-time public employee who would be adversely affected by the provisions of this subsection may apply to the ethics commission for an exemption from the prohibition against seeking employment with a person who is or may be regulated, when the person's education and experience is such that the prohibition would, for all practical purposes, deprive the person of the ability to earn a livelihood in this state outside of the governmental agency. The ethics commission shall by legislative rule establish general guidelines or standards for granting an exemption, but shall decide upon each application on a case-by-case basis.
- (i) Members of the Legislature required to vote.— Members of the Legislature who have asked to be excused from voting or who have made inquiry as to whether they should be excused from voting on a particular matter and who are required by the presiding officer of the House of Delegates or Senate of West Virginia to vote under the rules of the particular house shall not be guilty of any violation of ethics under the provisions of this section for a vote so cast.
- (j) Limitations on participation in licensing and ratemaking proceedings.—No public official or employee

323

324

325

326

327

328

329

330

331

332

292 may participate within the scope of his or her duties as 293 a public official or employee, except through ministerial 294 functions as defined in section three, article one of this 295 chapter, in any license or rate-making proceeding that 296 directly affects the license or rates of any person. 297 partnership, trust, business trust, corporation, or 298 association in which the public official or employee or 299 his or her immediate family owns or controls more than 300 ten percent. No public official or public employee may 301 participate within the scope of his or her duties as a 302 public official or public employee, except through 303 ministerial functions as defined in section three, article 304 one of this chapter, in any license or rate-making 305 proceeding that directly affects the license or rates of 306 any person to whom the public official or public 307 employee or his or her immediate family, or a partner-308 ship, trust, business trust, corporation, or association of 309 which the public official or employee, or his or her 310 immediate family, owns or controls more than ten 311 percent, has sold goods or services totaling more than 312 one thousand dollars during the preceding year, unless 313 the public official or public employee has filed a written 314 statement acknowledging such sale with the public 315 agency and the statement is entered in any public record 316 of the agency's proceedings. This subsection shall not be 317 construed to require the disclosure of clients of attorneys 318 or of patients or clients of persons licensed pursuant to 319 articles three, eight, fourteen, fourteen-a, fifteen, 320 sixteen, twenty, twenty-one or thirty-one, chapter thirty 321 of this code.

- (k) Certain expenses prohibited.—No public official or public employee shall knowingly request or accept from any governmental entity compensation or reimbursement for any expenses actually paid by a lobbyist and required by the provisions of this chapter to be reported, or actually paid by any other person.
- (l) Any person who is employed as a member of the faculty or staff of a public institution of higher education and who is engaged in teaching, research, consulting or publication activities in his or her field of expertise with public or private entities and thereby

333 derives private benefits from such activities shall be 334 exempt from the prohibitions contained in subsections 335 (b), (c) and (d) of this section when the activity is 336 approved as a part of an employment contract with the 337 governing board of such institution or has been ap-338 proved by the employees' department supervisor or the 339 president of the institution by which the faculty or staff 340 member is employed.

341 (m) The commission by legislative rule promulgated 342 in accordance with chapter twenty-nine-a of this code 343 may define further exemptions from this section as 344 necessary or appropriate.

§6B-2-7. Financial disclosure statement; contents.

- The financial disclosure statement required under this article shall contain the following information:
- 3 (1) The name, residential and business addresses of 4 the person filing the statement and all names under 5 which the person does business.
- 6 (2) The name and address of each employer of the 7 person.
- 8 (3) The identification, by category, of every source of 9 income over five thousand dollars received during the 10 preceding calendar year, in his or her own name or by 11 any other person for his or her use or benefit, by the 12 person filing the statement, and a brief description of 13 the nature of the services for which the income was 14 received. This subdivision does not require a person 15 filing the statement who derives income from a business. 16 profession or occupation to disclose the individual 17 sources and items of income that constitute the gross 18 income of that business, profession or occupation, nor 19 does this subdivision require a person filing the 20 statement to report the source or amount of income 21 derived by his or her spouse.
 - (4) If the person profited or benefited in the year prior to the date of filing from a contract for the sale of goods or services to a state, county, municipal or other local governmental agency either directly or through a partnership, corporation or association in which such

22

23

24

25

55

56

57

58

59

 $\begin{array}{c} 60 \\ 61 \end{array}$

62

63

64

65

66

- person owned or controlled more than ten percent, the person shall describe the nature of the goods or services and identify the governmental agencies which purchased the goods or services.
- 31 (5) Each interest group or category listed below doing 32 business in this state with which the person filing the 33 statement did business or furnished services and from 34 which the person received more than twenty percent of 35 the person's gross income during the preceding calendar 36 year. The groups or categories are electric utilities, gas 37 utilities, telephone utilities, water utilities, cable 38 television companies, interstate transportation compan-39 ies, intrastate transportation companies, oil or gas retail 40 companies, banks, savings and loan associations, loan or 41 finance companies, manufacturing companies, surface 42 mining companies, deep mining companies, mining 43 equipment companies, chemical companies, insurance 44 companies, retail companies, beer, wine or liquor 45 companies or distributors, recreation related companies, 46 timbering companies, hospitals or other health care 47 providers, trade associations, professional associations, 48 associations of public employees or public officials, 49 counties, cities or towns, labor organizations, waste 50 disposal companies, wholesale companies, groups or 51 associations seeking to legalize gambling, advertising 52 companies, media companies, race tracks and promo-53 tional companies.
 - (6) The names of all persons, excluding that person's immediate family, parents, or grandparents residing or transacting business in the state to whom the person filing the statement owes, on the date of execution of this statement in the aggregate in his or her own name or in the name of any other person more than twelve thousand five hundred dollars: *Provided*, That nothing herein shall require the disclosure of a mortgage on the person's primary and secondary residences or of automobile loans on automobiles maintained for the use of the person's immediate family, or of a student loan, nor shall this section require the disclosure of debts which result from the ordinary conduct of such person's business, profession, or occupation or of debts of the

person filing the statement to any financial institution, credit card company, or business, in which the person has an ownership interest: *Provided, however*, That the previous proviso shall not exclude from disclosure loans obtained pursuant to the linked deposit program provided for in article one-a, chapter twelve of this code or any other loan or debt incurred which requires approval of the state or any of its political subdivisions.

68

69

70

71

72

73

74

75

76

77

78

79

80

81

82

83

84

85

86

87

88

89

90

91

92

93

94

95

96

97

98

99

 $100\\101$

102

103

104

105

106

 $107 \\ 108$

- (7) The names of all persons except immediate family members, parents and grandparents residing or transacting business in the state (other than a demand or savings account in a bank, savings and loan association. credit union or building and loan association or other similar depository) who owes on the date of execution of this statement, more, in the aggregate, than twelve thousand five hundred dollars to the person filing the statement, either in his or her own name or to any other person for his or her use or benefit. This subdivision does not require the disclosure of debts owed to the person filing the statement which debts result from the ordinary conduct of such person's business, profession or occupation or of loans made by the person filing the statement to any business in which the person has an ownership interest.
- (8) The source of each gift having a value of over one hundred dollars, received from a person having a direct and immediate interest in a governmental activity over which the person filing the statement has control, shall be reported by the person filing the statement when such gift is given to said person in his or her name or for his or her use or benefit during the preceding calendar year: Provided, That gifts received by will or by virtue of the laws of descent and distribution, or received from one's spouse, child, grandchild, parents or grandparents, or received by way of distribution from an inter vivos or testamentary trust established by the spouse or child, grandchild, or by an ancestor of the person filing the statement are not required to be reported. As used in this subdivision any series or plurality of gifts which exceeds in the aggregate the sum of one hundred dollars from the same source or

- 109 donor, either directly or indirectly, and in the same
- 110 calendar year, shall be regarded as a single gift in
- 111 excess of that aggregate amount.

§6B-2-8. Exceptions to financial disclosure requirements and conflicts of interest provisions.

- 1 (a) Any person regulated by the provisions of this 2 article need not report the holdings of or the source of 3 income from any of the holdings of:
- 4 (1) Any qualified blind trust; or
- 5 (2) A trust—
- 6 (A) Which was not created directly by such individual, 7 his spouse, or any dependent child, and
- 8 (B) The holdings or sources of income of which such 9 individual, or a member of his or her immediate family 10 have no knowledge.
- Failure to report the holdings of or the source of income of any trust referred to herein in good faith reliance upon this section shall not constitute a violation of sections six or seven of this article.
- 15 (b) The provisions of subsection (d), section five of this 16 article shall not apply to holdings which are assets 17 within the trusts referred to in subsection (a) of this 18 section.
- 19 (c) For purposes of this section, the term "qualified 20 blind trust" includes a trust in which a regulated person 21 or immediate family has a beneficial interest in the 22 principal or income, and which meets the following 23 requirements:
- 24 (1) The trustee of the trust is a financial institution, 25 an attorney, a certified public accountant, a broker, or 26 an investment adviser, who (in the case of a financial 27 institution or investment company, any officer or 28 employee involved in the management or control of the 29 trust)—
- 30 (A) Is independent of and unassociated with any 31 interested party so that the trustee cannot be controlled 32 or influenced in the administration of the trust by any

33 interested party;

39

44

45

46

47

48 49

50

51

52

53

54

55

56

57

58

59

 $\frac{60}{61}$

62

63

64

65

66

67

68

69

- 34 (B) Is not or has not been an employee of any 35 interested party, or any organization affiliated with any 36 interested party and is not a partner of, or involved in 37 any joint venture or other investment with, any inter-38 ested party; and
 - (C) Is not a relative of any interested party.
- 40 (2) Any asset transferred to the trust by an interested 41 party is free of any restriction with respect to its 42 transfer or sale unless such restriction is expressly 43 approved by the ethics commission;
 - (3) The trust instrument which establishes the trust provides that—
 - (A) Except to the extent provided in paragraph (F) of this subdivision the trustee in the exercise of his authority and discretion to manage and control the assets of the trust shall not consult or notify any interested party;
 - (B) The trust shall not contain any asset the holding of which by an interested party is prohibited by any law or regulation;
 - (C) The trustee shall promptly notify the regulated person and the ethics commission when the holdings of any particular asset transferred to the trust by any interested party are disposed of;
 - (D) The trust tax return shall be prepared by the trustee or his designee, and such return and any information relating thereto (other than the trust income summarized in appropriate categories necessary to complete an interested party's tax return), shall not be disclosed to any interested party;
 - (E) An interested party shall not receive any report on the holdings and sources of income of the trust, except a report at the end of each calendar quarter with respect to the total cash value of the interest of the interested party in the trust or the net income or loss of the trust or any reports necessary to enable the interested party to complete an individual tax return

- required by law, but such report shall not identify any asset or holding;
- 73 (F) Except for communications which solely consist of 74 requests for distribution of cash or other unspecified assets of the trust, there shall be no direct or indirect 75 76 communication between the trustee and an interested 77 party with respect to the trust unless such communica-78 tion is in writing and unless it relates only (i) to the 79 general financial interest and needs of the interested party (including, but not limited to, an interest in 80 81 maximizing income or long-term capital gain), (ii) to the notification of the trustee of a law or regulation 82 83 subsequently applicable to the reporting individual 84 which prohibits the interested party from holding an asset, which notification directs that the asset not be 85 86 held by the trust, or (iii) to directions to the trustee to sell all of an asset initially placed in the trust by an 87 88 interested party which in the determination of the 89 reporting individual creates a conflict of interest or the 90 appearance thereof due to the subsequent assumption of 91 duties by the reporting individual (but nothing herein 92 shall require any such direction); and
- 93 (G) The interested parties shall make no effort to 94 obtain information with respect to the holdings of the 95 trust, including obtaining a copy of any trust tax return 96 filed or any information relating thereto except as 97 otherwise provided in this section.
- 98 (4) The proposed trust instrument and the proposed 99 trustee is approved by the ethics commission and 100 approval shall be given if the conditions of this section 101 are met.

ARTICLE 2A. RULES.

§6B-2A-1. Legislative rules; revocation of existing commission emergency rules; manner of reporting.

- 1 (a) West Virginia ethics commission emergency rule 2 one hundred fifty-eight is hereby revoked.
- 3 (b) Any disclosure form, statement or report required 4 under any provision of this chapter shall be made in a

5 manner prescribed by legislative rule of the commission.

ARTICLE 3. LOBBYISTS.

§6B-3-4. Reporting by lobbyists.

- (a) A lobbyist shall file with the commission reports of his lobbying activities, signed under oath or affirmation by the lobbyist. Lobbyists who are required under this article to file copies of their registration statements with the clerks of the respective houses of the Legislature shall also contemporaneously file copies of all reports required under this section with the clerks. Such reports shall be filed as follows:
- 9 (1) On or before the second Monday in January of each 10 year, a lobbyist shall file an annual report of all 11 lobbying activities which he or she engaged in during 12 the preceding calendar year; and
- 13 (2) If a lobbyist engages in lobbying with respect to legislation, then:
 - (A) Between the fortieth and forty-fifth days of any regular session of the Legislature in which any such lobbying occurred, the lobbyist shall file a report describing all of his or her lobbying activities which occurred since the beginning of the calendar year; and
 - (B) Within twenty-one days after the adjournment sine die of any regular or extraordinary session of the Legislature in which any such lobbying occurred, the lobbyist shall file a report describing all of his or her lobbying activities which occurred since the beginning of the calendar year or since the filing of the last report required by this section, whichever is later.
 - (b) (1) Except as otherwise provided in this section, each report filed by a lobbyist shall show the total amount of all expenditures for lobbying made or incurred by such lobbyist, or on behalf of such lobbyist by the lobbyist's employer, during the period covered by the report. The report shall also show subtotals segregated according to financial category, including meals and beverages; living accommodations; advertising; travel; contributions; gifts to public officials or em-

50

51

52

53

54

55

56

- ployees or to members of the immediate family of such persons; and other expenses or services.
- 38 (2) Lobbyists are not required to report the following:
- 39 (A) Unreimbursed personal living and travel expenses 40 not incurred directly for lobbying;
- 41 (B) Any expenses incurred for his or her own living accommodations;
- 43 (C) Any expenses incurred for his or her own travel 44 to and from public meetings or hearings of the legisla-45 tive and executive branches;
- 46 (D) Any expenses incurred for telephone, and any 47 office expenses, including rent and salaries and wages 48 paid for staff and secretarial assistance; and
 - (E) Separate expenditures to or on behalf of a public official or employee in an amount of less than five dollars.
 - (c) If a lobbyist is employed by more than one employer, the report shall show the proportionate amount of such expenditures in each category incurred on behalf of each of his employers.
 - (d) The report shall describe the subject matter of the lobbying activities in which the lobbyist has been engaged during the reporting period.
- 59 (e) If, during the period covered by the report, the 60 lobbyist made expenditures in the reporting categories 61 of meals and beverages, living accommodations, travel, 62 gifts or other expenditures, other than for those 63 expenditures governed by subsection (f) of this section, 64 which expenditures in any such reporting category total more than twenty-five dollars to or on behalf of any 65 66 particular public official or employee, the lobbyist shall report the name of the public official or employee to 67 68 whom or on whose behalf the expenditures were made. 69 the total amount of the expenditures, and the subject 70 matter of the lobbying activity, if any. Under this 71 subsection (e), no portion of the amount of an expendi-72 ture for a dinner, party, or other function sponsored by 73 a lobbyist or a lobbyist's employer need be attributed to

or counted toward the reporting amount of twenty-five dollars for a particular public official or employee who attends such function if the sponsor has invited to the function all the members of (1) the Legislature, (2) either house of the Legislature, (3) a standing or select committee of either house, or (4) a joint committee of the two houses of the Legislature. However, the amount spent for such function shall be added to other expenditures for the purpose of determining the total amount of expenditures reported under subsection (b) of this section.

(f) If, during the period covered by the report, the lobbyist made expenditures in the reporting categories of meals and beverages, lodging, travel, gifts and scheduled entertainment, which reporting expenditures in any such reporting category total more than twenty-five dollars for or on behalf of a particular public official or public employee in return for the participation of the public official or employee in a panel or speaking engagement at the meeting, the lobbyist shall report the name of the public official or employee to whom or on whose behalf the expenditures were made and the total amount of the expenditures.

Enr. Com. Sub. for H. B. 4596] 30

® **€ GCJU** € 641

The Joint Committee on Enrolled Bills hereby certifies that the foregoing bill is correctly enrolled.
Helle L. Hirl. Chairman Senate Committee
Bernard V. Kelly Chairman House Committee
Originating in the House.
Takes effect ninety days from passage. **Clerk of the Senate**
Clerk of the House of Delegates
President of the Senate
Speaker of the House of Delegates
The within La approved this the 30 kd
day of Maris M, 1996. Why

LECOCIARON IN THE

GOVERNOR
Dete 3/30/40
Time 3:55pm